

# Mapping The Research Landscape of Customer Loyalty on Beauty Clinic Consumers

Vina Islami

Universitas Bina Sarana Informatika  
Jl Kramat Raya no 98, Jakarta, Indonesia

Corresponding e-mail: [vina.vii@bsi.ac.id](mailto:vina.vii@bsi.ac.id)

---

Submission:	Revision:	Acceptance:	Available Online:
06-06-2024	01-07-2024	01-08-2024	12-08-2024

---

**Abstract** - Beauty skin care has now become a necessity for everyone who wants healthy skin. The lifestyle of women demands more attention to appearance, for that skin care is very important for everyone. Skin and facial care is one of the main needs of modern women who will support their activities. This need is so noticed by skin health and beauty care service companies, that various skin and facial care clinic businesses have sprung up, especially in big cities. This paper contributes to this field by presenting an analysis of new econometric literature on academic research on customer loyalty in the beauty clinic industry. This method utilizes tools like VOSviewer to visualize and analyze bibliographic data, enabling researchers to identify key concepts, research directions, and emerging trends in a particular field. VOSviewer, a widely used software, helps in mapping relationships between concepts, determining research trends, and providing insights for future studies. This study reviewed the comprehensive Scopus database, analyzing 383 documents to identify key metrics, such as influential publication sources, keywords, countries, affiliations, and authors. The results revealed a growing number of publications related to consumer loyalty.

**Keywords:** Customer loyalty, Bibliometric analysis, Customer satisfaction

## 1. Introduction

Beauty treatments have become essential for people who want healthy skin. Nowadays, as women's lifestyles change, appearance needs to be taken care of, and skincare is very important for everyone. Skincare and facial care is one of the main needs that support the activities of modern women. This need has been taken into consideration by health and beauty care companies, and various skin care and facial clinic companies have sprung up, especially in big cities.

Beauty clinics have become an increasingly important necessity for many people, not only to maintain their appearance, but also to boost their self-confidence and well-being. This need has led skincare entrepreneurs to compete for the best beauty clinics that offer a variety of excellent services.

According to a Statista report, the beauty and personal care market revenue is expected to reach \$7.23 billion or Rp111.83 trillion by 2022. The market is expected to grow at a CAGR of 5.81% per year (CAGR or annual growth rate from 2022 to 2027). In particular, the largest market segment is the personal care field, with a market size of \$3.18 billion in 2022. Followed by skincare with \$2.05 billion, cosmetics with \$1.61 billion, and fragrances with \$39 million. Based on population, the beauty and personal care market is expected to generate revenue

of USD 25.90 per capita in Indonesia by 2022. The beauty and personal care market is expected to generate 15.8% of its total revenue from online sales by 2022. ([databoks.katadata.co.id/datapublish/2022](http://databoks.katadata.co.id/datapublish/2022)).

Bibliometric analysis allows us to understand and analyze the huge expansion of data published on the topic since the documents were first published in 2016 until now. This paper will analyze research on robo-advisors and their adoption by using Vos Viewer and Biblioshiny. These two software create graphs that reflect data with various attributes from multiple data sources. Researchers can effectively and viably organize data through visual mapping of the distributed writing (Donthu et al., 2021). Besides, this strategy of investigation permits creators to recognize critical investigate patterns and the foremost regularly cited creators and articles in a expansive number of logical distributions on a specific theme. In addition, bibliometric analysis can determine the development of robo-advisor research and its close relationship with current technologies and artificial intelligence. Bibliometrics can also provide a scientific overview of descriptive research on a particular topic, can determine which publishers publish a large number of papers on a particular topic, and which countries, journals and authors influence the research topic. (Biancone et al., 2020).

Customer loyalty is the level of custom

er loyalty or loyalty to a particular brand, product or service. It reflects the extent to which customers are willing to consistently choose and use products or services from a particular company or brand compared to its competitors. (YuSheng & Ibrahim, 2019) Customer loyalty can be reflected in the tendency of customers to make repeat purchases, recommend products or services to others, and remain loyal to the brand or company over a longer period of time. (Tannady & Purnamaningsih, 2023). Customer loyalty describes the level of customer loyalty or loyalty to a particular brand, product or service. This includes the tendency of customers to consistently choose and use products or services from a company compared to its competitors. Customer loyalty can be reflected in a positive attitude towards the brand, the desire to continue using the product or service, and the tendency to recommend it to others. (Cui et al., 2023)

Customer loyalty may be a pivotal angle for businesses, demonstrating fulfilled clients who make rehash buys (Kirillova & Zyk, 2023). It is influenced by various factors such as service quality, price, location, customer experience, and customer value (Miryanda, 2023). Understanding the determinants and consequences of customer loyalty is essential for effective marketing strategies and business success (Rahayu & Harsono, 2023)

Service quality could be a vital viewpoint in commerce victory, characterized as the degree to which an organization meets or surpasses client desires in conveying administration (Dimaro, 2023). It is a measure of how well a company's services align with what customers anticipate, influencing their satisfaction levels and loyalty towards the brand. Service quality models vary across industries, with the need for customization based on specific environments and technologies like artificial intelligence and big data playing a significant role in enhancing service quality, particularly in fast food restaurants (Udayalakshmi & Sridevi, 2023). Ultimately, service quality aims to instill confidence in customers, ensuring their needs are met, and minimizing complaints, leading to increased satisfaction and long-term loyalty (Miko et al., 2022).

According to (Kotler & Keller, 2012), service quality is any activity or movement that can be advertised by a party to another party, essentially intangible and does not result in any proprietorship. Meanwhile, (Tjiptono, F., & Chandra, 2016) states that service quality is about understanding the quality of service itself, then expanding it to fitness for use and conformance to requirement. Quality may be an energetic condition related to items, administrations, individuals, forms, and situations that meet surpass desires (Karamustafa-Köse et al., 2022). According to (Kotler & Armstrong, 2014) service is an movement or an arrangement of exercises that are undetectable (not discernable) that happen as a result of intelligent between clients and workers or

other things given by the benefit supplier company which are planning to unravel client / client issues. According to (Rangkuti, 2009), in defining benefit procedures and programs, companies must be situated towards the interface of clients by paying consideration to benefit quality components. According to (Hapsari et al., 2021) service quality is something that is perceived by customers. Customers will evaluate the quality of a seen benefit based on what they depict in their minds. Clients will switch to other benefit suppliers who are way better able to get it the particular needs of clients and give superior benefit.

Low quality will lead to customer dissatisfaction. Hence, disillusioned clients will tell at slightest 15 other individuals. As a result, potential clients will make their choice to competitors (Issock et al., 2020). Service quality energizes clients to commit to the items and administrations of a company so that it has an affect on expanding the showcase share of a item. Benefit quality is significant in holding clients for a long time. Companies that have prevalent benefit will be able to maximize company execution (Barutcu & Tomas, 2013).

Research gaps in customer loyalty include service recovery resilience, return satisfaction, and social selling activity. Future studies should explore these areas for a comprehensive understanding of customer loyalty trends. (Fitriani et al., 2024). The research gap in SLR beauty clinic research is the lack of research that integrates customer satisfaction, service quality, and customer loyalty comprehensively. So this research tries to see the extent to which these variables affect consumer loyalty with the SLR method. In addition, many Research in the study of SLR beauty clinic include discrepancies between consumer expectations and perceptions, such as the need for improved cleanliness, staff responsiveness, service standards, and facility amenities.

Customer satisfaction is the level of client fulfillment or fulfillment with the items or administrations given by a company. It reflects the degree to which client desires and needs are met by the item or benefit gotten. Client fulfillment can be measured through client assessments of item quality, benefit execution, cost, client encounter, and other variables that influence their recognition of the esteem given by the company (A. A. Hamzah & Shamsudin, 2020). Customer satisfaction is an important factor in maintaining long-term relationships with customers, because satisfied customers tend to be loyal, provide positive recommendations, and have the potential to make repeat purchases. Therefore, understanding and meeting customer needs and expectations is the key to achieving long-term business success. (A. Hamzah, 2022)

According to Kotler in (tjiptono, f., & chandra, 2016) in measuring customer satisfaction

there are four methods, (1) complaints and suggestions system, (2) customer satisfaction survey, (3) ghost shopping, and (4) lost customer analysis. Recent research related to customer satisfaction includes (gunawan, 2022), (alonso-dos-santos et al., 2020), (singh et al., 2020), (rangriz et al., 2020).

## 2. Research Methods

Information Collection Scopus is broadly recognized as one of the foremost well-known intrigue unique and quotation databases. Scopus encourages get to to peer-reviewed logical distributions such as books, diaries, and symposia. Publisher-provided metadata incorporates creator title, alliance, year of report distribution, electronic article ID (EID), source title, volume/edition/page, quotation check, source, report category, and computerized arrange. Protest identifier (DOI). Scopus contains more than 84 million records from 27,000 diaries and more than 7,000 distributors. Agreeing to Elsevier's Quick Reality location, its papers account for approximately 18% of the world's investigate and 28% of citations. Furthermore, Biancone et al. (2020) concluded that based on previous information, the Scopus database is a good and reliable source for bibliographic analysis.

Therefore, the authors of this study conducted a bibliographic search using the Scopus database. Methodology this article addresses the inquire about address utilizing three diverse econometric writing examination methods: execution examination, logical mapping, and organize investigation (Donthu et al., 2021). Performance analysis examines the number of relevant publications and citations and identifies the number of authors, journals, and countries that contribute to research on robo-advisor adoption (Donthu et al., 2021). This method shows which journals, authors, and articles are most frequently cited or useful. In addition, scientific mapping techniques allow researchers to show how different studies on a particular topic relate to each other. This approach performs distinctive sorts of examination to decide distributions, basic topics, and connections between

subjects. Quotation and co-citation examination, collocation examination, and co-author investigation. At long last, the final method is arrange examination. It employments clustering and organize measurements to show diverse comes about. (Biancone et al., 2020)

The Scopus database was searched using the terms "loyalty" OR "Customer Loyalty" OR "loyalty" AND "satisfaction" to collect relevant data. This keyword was chosen to find research that specifically discusses customer loyalty. Methodology This article uses different econometric literature analysis techniques: performance analysis and scientific mapping. Performance analysis examines the number of relevant publications and citations and identifies the number of authors, journals, and countries contributing to research on customer loyalty (Donthu et al., 2021).

This method shows which authors, journals and articles are most frequently cited or useful. Furthermore, logical mapping methods permit analysts to appear how different considers on a specific subject relate to each other. This approach performs different sorts of investigation to decide distributions, their fundamental topics, and the connections between topics. quotation and co-citation examination, collocation examination, and co-author investigation.

## 3. Results and Discussion

### 3.1 Bibliometric Analysis Results

#### 3.1.1 Source and Publication Focus Area

A search with the keywords "loyalty" OR "customer loyalty" OR "satisfaction" AND "Loyalty" yielded 383 documents. The results demonstrate substantial academic interest in robo-advisors and their adoption. Table 1 shows that articles and conference papers comprised the majority of documents identified (69% and 17% of all documents, respectively). Followed by reviews (7% of identified documents), book chapters (4%), and books (3%). The lower number of reviews, book chapters, and books identified indicates the relative newness of the subject.

Tabel 1. Key data information, from the first paper published to January 2024

Result	Total
Article	263
Conference paper	64
Review	26
Book chapter	15
Book	13
Editorial	2
Total Documents	383
Annual growth rate	52.29
Average citations per document	11.57
Documents with a Single Author	50
Co-Authors per Document	2.94

Source: Scopus, created in Excel

The subjects of “customer loyalty” or “loyalty” (Table 2). Most publications (38%) are in the fields of business, management and accounting, followed by management (20%), economics, econometrics and finance (14%), and social sciences

(10%). The large amount of research in these four fields is because the topic of robo-advisors is a combination of financial technology, artificial intelligence (computer science), and management and economics for investment portfolio management.

Table 2: Areas of publication material

Field of Study	Total Results	%
Business, Management and Accounting	294	38%
Management	151	20%
Economics, Econometrics and Finance	105	14%
Social Science	73	9%
Engineering	51	7%
Decision Science	34	4%
Psychology	19	2%
Environmental Science	18	2%
Arts and Humanities	12	2%
Multidisciplinary	5	1%
More	8	1%

Source: Scopus, created in Excel

### 3.1.2. Most Cited Publication Sources

Table 3 displays the 20 most cited publication sources for articles on robo-advisors and their adoption. The five most cited sources are Journal of Management Information Systems, Journal of Business Economics, Journal of Service Industries, Small Business Economics, and Industrial Management. Each of these five publications has more than 100 citations in this analysis, indicating that the journals are of sufficient quality for this analysis.

### 3.1.3. Most Cited Publication Sources by Country

Figure 3 shows the number of citations related to consumer loyalty, by country of publication. The number of citations is dominated by the United States and Europe. Figure 3 shows the 10 most cited sources. The top five cited sources include leading journals, such as the European Journal of Management and Business Economics, International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management, Journal of Management Information Systems, Journal of Business Economics, Service Industries Journal, Small Business Economics

Table 3: Subject areas of publications

Journal	Number of Citation
Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal	411
Asia Pacific Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship	307
British Food Journal	368
EuroMed Journal of Business	193
European Journal of Innovation Management	184
European Journal of Management and Business Economics	143
European Journal of Management Studies	141
European Journal of Marketing	106
Innovation & Management Review	104
International Hospitality Review	95
International Journal of Bank Marketing	85
International Journal of Lean Six Sigma	84
International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management	83
International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy	68
International Journal of Sports Marketing and Sponsorship	67
Internet Research	65
Islamic Economic Studies	65
Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing	64
Journal of Enterprising Communities: People and Places in the Global Economy	62
Journal of Fashion Marketing and Management: An International Journal	62
Journal of Product & Brand Management	62
Journal of Service Management	57



Research on customer loyalty today reveals several gaps that offer opportunities for further exploration. Studies emphasize the importance of customer engagement through social media in building trust, commitment, and ultimately loyalty (Chou et al., 2023). Also, the affect of e-service quality and deals advancement on e-trust and e-satisfaction essentially impacts client dependability within the advanced economy (Louisa & Simbolon, 2023). However, there are areas within customer loyalty research that remain underexplored, such as service recovery resilience, flexibility, return satisfaction, social selling activity, mindfulness, and ethical behavior (Fitriani et al., 2024).

These gaps present avenues for future research to enhance our understanding of the multifaceted dynamics influencing customer loyalty across various industries and sectors. The significance of customer loyalty research cannot be exaggerated in today's competitive trade scene. Understanding what keeps clients coming back and developing strong associations with them is crucial for bolstered triumph. Steadfast clients are more likely to proceed acquiring from a company over time, contributing to steady income streams and possibly higher lifetime esteem per client. Investigating client dependability makes a difference recognize methodologies. Steadfast clients are frequently willing to supply profitable input, empowering businesses to progress items, administrations, and client encounters based on honest to goodness experiences (Khaled et al., 2023)

#### 4. Conclusion

Based on the keywords most frequently used by authors, further research is needed regarding the latest variables that appear in the vosviewer analysis. Variables such as "emotional loyalty" and "brand happiness" are the latest or increasingly popular variables. Previously, "loyalty", "trust", "intention" were often used. This trend may be due to regulatory sanctions and the use of these terms in the industry, making it interesting for academics to investigate user intentions related to trust, perception, and usability and the theories used as a foundation for this topic.

The scope of this research is still limited because this research only focuses on customer loyalty variables and the factors that influence them. It is expected that researchers will be interested in new variables that emerge to be studied in more depth. Future studies may include more observations to evaluate the veracity of the findings presented in this article and present emerging patterns and trends in the field of customer loyalty and behavior.

#### Reference

Barutcu, S., & Tomas, M. (2013). Sustainable Social Media Marketing and Measuring Effectiveness of Social Media Marketing. *Journal of Internet Applications and Management*, 4(1), 5–24.

- <https://doi.org/10.5505/iuyd.2013.69188>  
Biancone, P. Pietro, Saiti, B., Petricean, D., & Chmet, F. (2020). The bibliometric analysis of Islamic banking and finance. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*, 11(10), 2069–2086. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIABR-08-2020-0235>
- Chou, S., Chen, C.-W., & Wong, M. (2023). When social media meets low-cost airlines: Will customer engagement increase customer loyalty? *Research in Transportation Business & Management*, 47, 100945. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rtbm.2023.100945>
- Cui, L., He, S., Deng, H., & Wang, X. (2023). Sustaining customer loyalty of fresh food e-tailers: an empirical study in China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 35(3), 669–686. <https://doi.org/10.1108/APJML-01-2022-0013>
- Dimaro, M. E. (2023). Service Quality for Customers' Satisfaction: A Literature Review. *European Modern Studies Journal*, 7(1), 267–276. [https://doi.org/10.59573/emsj.7\(1\).2023.24](https://doi.org/10.59573/emsj.7(1).2023.24)
- Donthu, N., Kumar, S., Mukherjee, D., Pandey, N., & Lim, W. M. (2021). How to conduct a bibliometric analysis: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, 133, 285–296. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2021.04.070>
- Fitriani, N., Rizan, M., Wibowo, S. F., & Sebayang, K. D. A. (2024). Discovering Trends of Customer Loyalty Research: A VOSviewer-Assisted Systematic Review. *International Journal of Management and Development Studies*, 13(4), 01–12. <https://doi.org/10.53983/ijmds.v13n4.001>
- Hamzah, A. (2022). The Intervening Role of Customer Loyalty and Self-Efficacy on the Relationship Between of Customer Satisfaction, Customer Trust, Customer Commitment, Customer Value and Customer Citizenship Behavior in Hospitality Industry in Guangdong, China. *Journal of International Business and Management*. <https://doi.org/10.37227/JIBM-2022-12-5621>
- Hamzah, A. A., & Shamsudin, M. F. (2020). Why customer satisfaction is important to business? *Journal of Undergraduate Social Science ....* <http://www.abrn.asia/ojs/index.php/JUSST/article/view/58>
- Hapsari, Y., Suhud, U., & Mukhtar, S. (2021). Influence of Service Quality, Innovation, Price, Promotion on Customer Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty. *Accounting & Finance ....* <https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&profile=ehost&scope=site&authtype=crawler&jrnl=23079878&AN=153143798&h=RZ7gDd%2BPguzLIn1gWFd1HeThuyKoXbAG8LM9VFCeY%2BQhAfDy1gtNRqXNvJrHXL>

- NVFetp8LAWdLkGzuAFz%2BFDRg%3D%3D&crl=c
- Issock, P. B. I., Mpinganjira, M., & ... (2020). Modelling green customer loyalty and positive word of mouth: can environmental knowledge make the difference in an emerging market? *International Journal of ...*  
<https://doi.org/10.1108/IJOEM-09-2018-0489>
- Karamustafa-Köse, G., Schneider, S. C., & Davis, J. D. (2022). Unpacking the dynamics in acquisition of capabilities: the role of identities during postmerger integration. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 35(8), 13–38. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JOCM-02-2021-0053>
- Khaled, A. S. D., Almugari, F., Dalaien, B. O. A. Al, Saeed, A. M. M., & Alomari, K. M. (2023). Understanding customer satisfaction and loyalty in Indian retail sector: an empirical study. *International Journal of Business Excellence*, 31(1), 49–74.  
<https://doi.org/10.1504/IJBEX.2023.133555>
- Kirilova, T. V., & Zyk, E. A. (2023). Consumer loyalty: a critical analysis of approaches towards definition. *Research Result Business and Service Technologies*, 9(2).  
<https://doi.org/10.18413/2408-9346-2023-9-2-0-7>
- Kotler, P., & Armstrong, G. (2014). *Principle Of Marketing, 15th edition*. Pearson Pretice Hall.
- Kotler, P., & Keller, K. L. (2012). *Marketing Management (14th ed.)*. Prentice Hall.
- Louisa, L., & Simbolon, F. P. (2023). Determinants of Customer Loyalty: Empirical Study from Online Food Delivery Services. *Binus Business Review*, 14(3), 247–258.  
<https://doi.org/10.21512/bbr.v14i3.9233>
- Miko, Dewi Anggraini, A. Mahendra, & Fauzi A.M. Hutabarat. (2022). Pengaruh Kualitas Layanan Terhadap Kepuasan Pelanggan Perusahaan Rh Interior. *SOSMANIORA: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 1(2), 240–245.  
<https://doi.org/10.55123/sosmaniora.v1i2.581>
- Miryanda, A. (2023). Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan, Harga, Dan Lokasi Terhadap Loyalitas Pelanggan (Studi Kasus Pada PT. Tiki Jalur Nugraha Ekakurir (JNE) Cabang Medan Marelان). *Jurnal Mahkota Bisnis (Makbis)*, 2(1). <https://doi.org/10.59929/mm.v2i1.19>
- Rahayu, S., & Harsono, M. (2023). Loyalitas Konsumen : Konseptualisasi, Anteseden dan Konsekuensi. *Jesya*, 6(2), 1581–1594.  
<https://doi.org/10.36778/jesya.v6i2.1196>
- Rangkuti, F. (2009). *Strategi Promosi yang kreatif & Analisis kasus – Integrated Marketing Communication*. PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Tannady, H., & Purnamaningsih, P. (2023). Determinant Factors Customer Satisfaction and its Implication on Customer Loyalty: From the Perspective of Customers of Vespa. *International Journal of Science, Technology & Management*, 4(2), 434–438.  
<https://doi.org/10.46729/ijstm.v4i2.786>
- Tjiptono, F., & Chandra, G. (2016). *Service, Quality & Satisfaction (4th ed.)*. Andi.
- Udayalakshmi, C., & Sridevi, J. (2023). Service quality models: A review with respect to fast food restaurants. *BOHR International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research*, 2(1), 92–96.  
<https://doi.org/10.54646/bijsshr.2023.30>
- YuSheng, K., & Ibrahim, M. (2019). Service innovation, service delivery and customer satisfaction and loyalty in the banking sector of Ghana. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-06-2018-0142>